



**Minutes of the MoP 4th Quarterly Meeting on
Final List of Adaptation Indicators for Integration into NSDP 2019-23 and
Update Report of the PPCR Core Indicators**

Package C: Gender, Monitoring and Evaluation, and Mainstreaming at Sub-national Levels



**Phnom Penh, Tonle Bassak II Restaurant,
5 July 2018**

Table of Contents

I. Background	3
The objectives of the quarterly meeting were:.....	3
II. Key Results of the Quarterly Meeting	3
III. Proceedings of the Quarterly Meeting	3
IV. Summary of Feedback and Findings	10
V. Wrap Up and Next Steps	11
Annex 1: Agenda of the 4 th Quarterly Meeting	12
Annex 2: List of Participants	12

I. Background

The Quarterly Meeting is regularly organized in every three months to consult and collect feedback on various aspects of M&E of adaptation and related data collection, M&E institutional coordination; awareness raising and capacity building; and integration of adaptation indicators into national, sector and SNA Plans. The third quarterly meeting was organized on 13 February to review a list of submitted adaptation indicators and baselines for integration into NSDP 2019-23. A few adaptation indicators have been selected through consultation with key officers from planning departments, sector M&E units, and relevant technical departments.

The fourth Quarterly Meeting is convened to finalize the adaptation indicators, the baselines and data collection methodologies for each indicator, and pilot data collection. The meeting will also discuss the institutional mechanism of sub-national M&E working group on climate change adaptation under MOP, its Terms of Reference and Mode of Operandi. Initial report of the update PPCR score cards will be presented to get inputs from all stakeholders, including CSOs and private sector.

The meeting was attended by 30 key participants including officers involved in implementation of 8 SPCR projects, M&E units of sector ministries, MOE/NCSD and NCDDS.

The objectives of the quarterly meeting were:

1. Discussion on final list of adaptation indicators, baselines and data collection by four sector ministries;
2. Consultation on additional TOR of sub-national M&E working group on climate change adaptation;
3. Awareness and consultation on update scores of the PPCR Core indicators.

II. Key Results of the Quarterly Meeting

The results of the quarterly meeting were as the follows:

- A final list of adaptation indicators and baselines were agreed by key sector ministries;
- Improved existing national M&E working group with supplemented TOR;
- The report on PPCR Core Indicators were presented;

III. Proceedings of the Quarterly Meeting

The quarterly meeting was presided over by H.E. Hang Lina, Delegate of RGC and Director General of National Institute of Statistics, and H.E. Chuop Paris, MoE Secretary of State and Deputy Secretary General of the National Council for Sustainable Development (NCSD).

H.E. Hang Lina delivered open remarks by welcoming all the presiding over guests and participants for participating in this quarterly meeting. She informed the meeting the objectives and expected outputs including finalizing the adaption indicators submitted by the four key Ministries, discussion on supplemented TOR for the National M&E Framework Working Group, and preliminary presentation of update report of the PPCR Core indicators.

H.E. Chuop Paris delivered his key remarks by encouraging the participants to focus on two main points: 1) Adaptation indicators, 2) The TOR of the National CC M&E Working Group. He

described that the adaptation indicators for now is working on four sector Ministries, and MoP is the Ministry who in charge of reporting the progress SDG and NSDP, so it is right that MoP takes lead in developing national adaptation indicators. The Cambodia SDG localization (C-SDG) needs indicators at outcome level, and if the adaptation indicators could report at output level, it could be used for the NSDP. For the National CC M&E WG, it is important that MoP takes lead because of MoP has a mandate on data and statistics.

H.E. Hang Lina responded to H.E. Paris's comments that MoP has made localization of SDG into Cambodia context, and has submitted to the Supreme National Economic Council (SNEC) to review indicator could be included. Each Ministry submitted too many indicators like 300-400 indicators, and MoP has reviewed those submitted indicators and select the indicators again. There will be small groups meeting at MoP to discuss the indicators to be submit to the SDG.

Summary of presentations are described below.

3.1 Final list of adaptation indicators for NSDP 2019-23, By Dr. Neou Bonheur, Deputy Team Leader, and M&E Climate Change Specialist, ADB TA 8179 (Package-C)

The presentation includes demonstration on National Result Framework (result level), relationship between result frame work and M&E, types of dictators, chain of result for integrating in the NSDP, structure of adaptation with the program/projects, steps in identifying indicators for climate change adaptation, two national indicators that localized from the SDG, and finalist of adaptation indicators of four sector Ministries – MPWT, MRD, MAFF, and MoWRAM.

The final list of adaptation indicators for NSDP 2019-23 are listed in the table below, including two proposed national adaptation indicators selected from localized SDGs:

Table 1: National Adaptation Indicators (subject to more discussion)

No.	Name of Indicators	Definitions/Criteria	Year of Baseline	Responsibility
1	Direct disaster economic loss in relation to global gross domestic product (GDP)	Health, infrastructure, agricultural crops, livelihoods damaged by floods, droughts, and storms		CDC, MEF, MOP, NCDM and key sectors
2	Percentage of increase in public expenditure for climate change, disaggregated by key CC sensitive sectors:			MoWRAM, MPWT, MRD, MAFF, and MoH

Table 2: Adaptation Indicators of the Ministry of Rural Development (MRD)

No.	Name of Indicators	Definitions/Criteria	Year of Baseline	Responsibility
1.	Length of Rural Road (general)	Length of roads under management of Ministry of Rural Development. There are four types of Rural Roads: Type 1 - Connect from National Road or Provincial Road to a district; Rural Type 2 - Connect from district to commune; Type 3 - Connect from commune to commune; and Type 4 - Connect from commune to village or from village to village.	2014, 2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Rural Road (MRD)
2	Length of road with climate resilience/proofing design	a) VRA is conducted to define vulnerability and historical of impact	2014, 2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Rural Road (MRD)

	standards	as a basis for designing climate resilient roads; and b) The road structure has good drainage with bridges, culverts and road crest level is higher than maximum flood level; and c) Improved road pavement with DBST, concrete, or use of geo-textile materials to strengthen basement; and d) The road slopes are protected by grasses or trees (bio-engineering)		
3	Percentage of people access to safe and sanitation drinking water. The drinking water that resilient to climate change.	a) Supply by water pipe of the Water Supply Authority; and b) Well that protected from flood, no pollution from waste water, and garbage; and c) Pond water or natural water with treatment before drinking.	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Rural Water Supply (MRD)
4	Percentage of family with sanitation toilet that resilient to climate change	a) Toilet with septic tank and water proof; and b) Built higher than flood water level.	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	

Table 3: Adaptation Indicators of the Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT)

No.	Name of Indicators	Definitions, Criteria	Year of Baseline	Responsibility
1.	Length of National Road and Provincial (general)	Length of roads under management of MPWT. The road networks consist of 1 digit and 2 digit national roads, provincial roads (3 and 4 digit) connected from Capital City to province, from province to province, from province to district and from one national road to another national road.	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Road Infrastructure
2	Length of road with climate resilience/proofing design standards	a) VRA is conducted to define vulnerability and historical of impact as a basis for designing climate resilient roads; and b) The road structure has good drainage with bridges, culverts and road crest level is higher than maximum flood level; and c) Improved road pavement with DBST, concrete, or use of geo-textile materials to strengthen pavement and basement; and d) The road slopes are protected by grasses or trees (bio-engineering)	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Road Infrastructure

Table 4: Adaptation Indicators of the Ministry of Water Resources and Meteorology (MoWRAM)

No.	Name of Indicators	Definitions, Criteria	Year of Baseline	Responsibility
1.	Area of rice field that covered by irrigation system (general)	N/A	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Planning
2	Area of rice field that cover by climate resilient irrigation system	<p>a) Water is available during both rainy season and dry season, which can meet the needs of those rice crop areas in all seasons;</p> <p>b) The irrigation system has good operation in supplying and draining of water in the command area;</p> <p>c) There exists institutional mechanism and budget for maintenance and rehabilitation;</p> <p>d) Measure to respond to the needs of water stress in dry season and flooding (mobile water plumbing machines)</p>	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Planning, and Department of Agriculture Irrigation,
3	Number of farmer use communities trained on climate change adaptation and disaster risk reduction.		2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Planning; Department for Farmer Water User Community

Table 5: Adaptation Indicators of the Ministry of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries (MAFF)

No.	Name of Indicators	Criteria, Variable, and Calculation Method	Year of Baseline	In-Charge Department
1.	Area of planted climate resilient rice varieties	<p>a) Least impacted by floods and droughts (Sen Pidoa, Chulsa, IR66...);</p> <p>b) Saline resistant and Floating rice</p> <p>c) Relatively high Yield/production compared to other rice varieties.</p>	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Planning and Agriculture Statistics
2	Area of rice fields damaged by climate change: flood, drought, storm, and pest outbreak	Disaggregated by event: flood, drought and pest	2014,2015, 2016, 2017	Department of Planning and Agriculture Statistics

Table 6: Preliminary Baselines and Targets for the Proposed Adaptation Indicators

No	Name of Indicator	Baselines		Target					
		2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023
Ministry of Rural Deelopment									
1	Length of climate resilient roads		540	210	210	210	210	210	210
2	Number of officers trained on climate change assessment and climate proof design standard		0	4	4	4	3	3	3
3	% of rural people having access to climate resilience sanitation		55	60	70	75	80	85	90
4	% of rural people having access to safe drinking water supply		53	53	60	65	72	79	90
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries									
1	Agricultural areas planted by climate resilient rice varieties								
	Rainy season short term rice varieties		724,325						
	Dry season rice varieties		547,848						
	Floating rice		38,289						
	Saline resistant rice		NA						
2	Rice areas damaged by climate change (floods, drought, pest, storm)		8,061						
	Floods		13,306						
	Drought		15						
	Pest								
Ministry of Water Resources and Meteorology									
1	Rice areas irrigated by climate resilient irrigation schemes	137,815							
	Wet season	103,913							
	Dry season	33,901							
	Number of families	40,563							
2	Number of Farmer Water user Committees trained in CBADRR								
	Number of FWUC established	174							
Ministry of Public Works and Transport									
1	Length of national road incorporating climate change consideration								

Challenges of M&E of Adaptation

- Lack of financial resources and capacity for regular data collection.
- Challenges in quality assurance and data management.
- Challenges in access to climate data and data sharing.
- Lack of collaboration between stakeholders.
- Limited involvement of sector M&E officers in tracking progress of SPCR projects

3.2 Term of Reference of National Working Group on M&E for Adaptation Indicators, By Dr. Neou Bonheur, Deputy Team Leader, and M&E Climate Change Specialist, ADB TA 8179 (Package-C)

The presentation includes current ToR of the working group, and proposed additional ToR of the program of climate change adaptation.

a) Current ToR of the Working Group

- Study and identification of indicators and definitions which is being used in census, survey, and administration reports consistent to Cambodia context.
- Select indicators and identify methodology for data collections.
- Provide guidelines on defining definitions, identification of indicators, selection of indicators, and data collection methodology, to member Ministries and institutions.
- Provide training in defining definitions, identification and selection of indicators, and data collection methodology, to member Ministries and institutions.
- Develop M&E policy and national system for monitoring and evaluation of the NSDP implementation (MENI) for application at national level and provincial levels.

b) Proposed Additional ToR of the National M&E Working Group for Climate Change Adaptation.

- Provide guidance on definitions, identification of indicators, data collection methodology for monitoring climate change adaptation activities to member Ministries and institutions.
- Conduct training on identification and selection of indicators, and data collection methodology for monitoring climate change adaptation plans and projects, for member Ministries and institutions.
- Develop Nation M&E system for monitoring and evaluation of the climate change adaptation programs and projects to be integrated into the NSDP, and to be used at national, sector, and provincial levels.
- Organize semester meetings to update climate change adaption indicators with participation of key government officers, development partners, civil society, NGOs, and private sector.

3.3 Update of the PPCR M&E Report, By Dr. Neou Bonheur, Deputy Team Leader, and M&E Climate Change Specialist, ADB TA 8179 (Package-C).

The presentation demonstrated the progress of PPCR M&E Report for the eight SPCR projects implemented by December 2017. The update report is not complete which require additional focused group discussion and validation at the workshop.

3.4 Progress of Cambodia's National M&E Framework for Climate Change Adaptation, By Dr. Heng Chanthoeun, Deputy Director, Department of Climate Change, General Secretariat of National Council for Sustainable Development.

Current progress of the national M&E framework for CC response since 2013 is summarized below:

- Developing indicators: building baselines & updating values of indicators based on TAMD.
- Provides framework/guidance for sectors to develop their own sectoral CC M&E frameworks.
- Incorporation of an M&E framework into national and sub-national development planning processes will facilitate the tracking of impacts of climate change adaptation actions and verify the effectiveness of national development.
- DCC, working together with Climate Change Technical Working Group (CCTWG) with the active participation of MOP, is progressively increasing national capacity to track results of Cambodia's efforts to address CC.
- Scorecards were updated for 2017 for the 5 institutional readiness indicators (baselines 2014)
- All 5 indicators have shown an increase in national capacity to respond to CC

3.5 Synergies between NCSA's National M&E Framework for Climate Change Adaptation and the proposed M&E Framework on Adaptation under NSDP, By Dr. Bhujang Rao Dharmaji, Climate Change, Lead Climate Change Advisor (M & E), ADB TA 8179 (Package-C)

The presentation includes:

- Synergies between National M & E process and PPCR reporting:

Both national M & E process for NSDP monitoring and PPCR reporting processes have similar objectives. As such, both processes have Synergies and inter-linkages among them, as both the processes have similar functionality including:
 - Measure how effective adaptation efforts maintain development on track in a changing climate
 - Monitor climate change actions and low carbon development policies
 - Generate evidence and lessons to inform future policy making
 - Facilitate the coherent integration of M&E of climate change into national planning and key sectors
 - Provide information required to fulfil the reporting obligations of Cambodia to the UNFCCC and development partners
- National Adaptation Planning (NAP) process in Cambodia
- Cambodia's national climate change monitoring & evaluation framework.
- Salient features of PPCR Results Framework and its revision.
- What is Revised PPCR Results Reporting in Cambodia

Common Challenges faced by both PPCR Monitoring and Evaluation and National M & E framework: Administrative, Data and Financial Challenges.

3.6 Upon request of the meeting Bonheur also presented the current INDC adaptation priorities as listed below:

- Promoting and improving the adaptive capacity of communities, especially through community-based adaptation actions, and restoring the natural ecology system to respond to climate change
- Implementing management measures for protected areas to adapt to climate change
- Strengthening early warning systems and climate information dissemination

- Developing and rehabilitating the flood protection dykes for agricultural and urban development
- Increasing the use of mobile pumping stations and permanent stations in responding to mini-droughts, and promoting groundwater research in response to drought and climate risk
- Developing climate-proof agriculture systems for adapting to changes in water variability to enhance crop yields.
- Promoting climate resilient agriculture in coastal areas through building sea dykes and scaling-up of climate-smart farming system
- Developing crop varieties suitable to Agro-Ecological Zones (AEZ) and resilient to climate change
- Promoting aquaculture production systems and practices that are adaptive to climate change
- Repairing and rehabilitating existing road infrastructure and ensuring effective operation and maintenance, taking into account climate change impacts
- Up-scaling the Malaria Control Program towards pre-elimination status of malaria
- Up-scaling of national programmes to address the risk of acute respiratory infection, diarrhoeal disease and cholera in disaster-prone areas. Including conducting surveillance and research on water-borne and food-borne diseases associated with climate change
- Strengthening technical and institutional capacity to conduct climate change impact assessments, climate change projections, and mainstreaming

IV. Summary of Feedback and Findings

- H.E. Choup Paris agreed with the approach of the M&E of adaptation, and he proposed that additional adaptation indicators could be identified for MAFF sub-sectors such as for Fisheries, Animal Production... etc. He also requested that the indicators should be aligned with INDC adaptation priority.
- Bonheur appreciated H.E. Choup Paris comments, and responded that so far the proposed adaptation indicators are consistent with INDC, though not all can be covered during this Project period.
- Mr. Vuthy, CCCA: The CCTWG working on M&E and link to SDG), we want to see how CCTWG could link with the National Working Group M&E on Climate Change. He also requested that the sector indicators should reflect the priority of INDC and national policy.
- Ms. Clara: CCTWG has successes in designing localized indicators for SDG Goal #13, and she wondered how the current work of MOP complement or duplicate the work.
- Bonheur: The National M&E Working Group coordinates the M&E of development and adaptation which are well aligned with the National policies. We can have a meeting with CCTWG to discuss the proposed indicators with participation of senior officers, H.E. Tin Ponlok, H.E. Theng Pangathun, H.E. Hang Lina. He also informed that The M&E of adaptation and adaptation data will be shared through CAM-CRDS, which is now available online.
- H.E. Lay Chhan: We should review the ToR of the National Working Group on M&E to make sure it does not duplicate with other WGs.
- Bonheur: The additional ToR of the National Working on M&E would improve the responsibility of the existing National M&E Working Group in development and operation of adaptation indicators for different levels.
- Ms. Clara: We should not create more WGs. The CCTWG can assist development of M&E of adaptation along with NM&EWG.
- Mr. Sum Cheat requested to include GHG indicator as data is available in the CAMCLIMATE website. Bonheur said that we could include it, but the team would check if data is available in the website.

- Bhujang: The CIF Guideline does not recommend to set up additional working group, rather build on the existing mechanism. For the 8 SPCR 8 projects, we want all the key Ministries to collaborate for data sharing. We want to ensure two times meetings per year of the Working Group, and technical backstopping. The MoP to provide umbrella for the M&E. We want to ensure some sort of coordination and support to M&E.
- Bonheur: The CCTWG has no specialized data management skills like CAMInfo, so MOP can help to support data collection and management for all indicators, therefore collaboration is important. Participation of MoE and NCSD is very important, as they are now members of the NM&EWG.
- MoWA: MoWA representative would like to see gender responsive adaptation indicators included in the proposed list.
- H.E. Hang Lina: She agreed with H.E. Pagnathun that there was no need to set up new sub-working group, rather we will insure that representatives of key sector ministries will be invited to attend the meetings of NM&EWG.

V. Wrap Up and Next Steps

H.E. Hang Lina provided the closing remarks by summarizing the meeting results including: (1) the eleven sector indicators were presented discussed, and no objection the final list of the indicators; and (2) The additional ToR of the National Working Group on M&E were presented and discussed.

Conclusion and Next Step

- (1) The TA team and MoP will further discuss and review available data related to GHG indicators proposed by the NCSD/MoE;
- (2) The meeting agreed with the proposed adaptation indicators, additional consultation will be conducted to finalize the baselines and targets, including possible additional indicators;
- (3) The TA team will conduct additional focused group discussion to update the scores and values of PPCR core indicators;
- (4) The sub-National M&E Working Group should not be created under the National M&E Working Group, and the proposed supplementary TOR can facilitate the operation of M&E of adaptation. Further consultation will be conducted with H.E. Theng Pagnathun to finalize the proposed TOR;
- (5) The gender related indicators will be defined along with sector adaptation indicators.

Annex 1: Agenda of the 4th Quarterly Meeting

Time	Topic	Speaker/Facilitator
05 July 2018		
08:00 – 08:30	Registration	
Session 1: Opening Session		
08:30 - 08:35	Introduction of special guests National Anthem	MC
08:35 – 08:45	Opening remarks	H.E. Hang Lina
Session 2: M&E of Adaptation and Integration		
08:45 – 09:15	Final list of adaptation indicators for NSDP 2019-23	Bonheur
08:15 – 10:00	Discussion	H.E. Hang Lina
10:00 – 10:15	Tea break	
10:15 – 10:30	Proposed sub-national M&E working group for Climate Change	San Vannakreth
10:30 – 11:00	Discussion	H.E. Hang Lina
11:00 – 11:30	Update of the PPCR M&E report	Bonheur
11:30 – 12:00	Discussion and feedback	H.E. Hang Lina
12:00 – 13:00	Lunch break	
13:30 – 13:50	Progress of Cambodia's National M&E Framework for Climate Change Adaptation	Dr. Heng Chanthoeun/Va Vuthy
13:50 – 14:20	Synergies between NCSD's National M&E Framework for Climate Change Adaptation and the proposed M&E Framework on Adaptation under NSDP	Bhujang Rao Dharmaji
14:20 – 14:40	Pilot data collection and data sharing	Chan Samreth/Sam Sophal
14:40 – 15:30	Discussion	H.E. Hang Lina
15:30 -16:00	Tea break and wrap-up	H.E. Hang Lina

Annex 2: List of Participants